**Research article** 

# Hybrid Learning Implementation in English for Business Communication in Indonesian Vocational Higher Education

Andi MUSDARIAH<sup>\*</sup> [<u>andimusdariah.am@gmail.com]</u> Politeknik Negeri Ujung Pandang, Makassar, INDONESIA

\*Corresponding author: andimusdariah.am@gmail.com

#### Abstract:

This article investigates the implementation of hybrid learning in Business Communication at the vocational education level. The study adopts a virtual case study approach utilizing digital narrative inquiry to collect data on teachers' strategies for hybrid learning aimed at enhancing students' business communication performance. Findings reveal that one teacher successfully developed a self-initiated hybrid learning model during explorations in this field. The teacher integrated traditional instruction with diverse online platforms like Moodle, web-cloud video conferencing, Google Classroom, and social media platforms such as Facebook and WhatsApp to teach English for business communication. In contrast, other teachers demonstrated limited implementation of hybrid learning. Notably, the level of hybrid learning implementation was significantly linked to students' business English performance outcomes. Greater utilization of hybrid learning strategies correlated with improved student performance in business communication. The research carries implications for pedagogy, underscoring the significance of employing diverse hybrid learning strategies in English teaching.



Volume 1, Issue 2, 2023 Page 163-180

Article History Received: 19/06/2023 Revised: 31/07/2023 Accepted: 01/08/2023

#### **Keywords:**

Hybrid Learning Virtual case study Online learning platforms Indonesian Vocational Higher Education

**To cite this article:** Musdariah, A. (2023). *Hybrid Learning Implementation in English for Business Communication in Indonesian Vocational Higher Education*. Research and Innovation in Applied Linguistics-Electronic Journal (RIAL-EJ), Vol 1 (2), 163-180. <u>https://doi.org/10.31963/rial-ej.v1i2.4282</u>

## **INTRODUCTION**

mplementation is frequently interpreted as a sequence of purposeful and well-planned activities intended to incorporate evidence-based approaches into practical contexts (Albers & Pattuwage, 2017). In order to accomplish the primary objectives of the learning process, hybrid learning combines two or more methodologies and approaches. These instructional design systems employ a variety of teaching and learning techniques, and their implementation varies depending on the instructors, programs, and institutions involved (Purnomo et al., 2022).

A hybrid learning system can be implemented by mixing face-to-face class and online learning in the form of asynchronous, synchronous, or a mixture of both. The adoption of hybrid learning is based on two distinct approaches, the first of which is a simple set of teaching materials that are uploaded to a web server that incorporate an email discussion forum. The second method involves integrating diverse learning materials richen in multimedia and information systems with other educational resources such as academic, assessment, communication, and discussion platforms (Lestari, 2016). Incorporating face-toface instruction with online instruction in the format of synchronous, asynchronous, or a combination of both is known as a hybrid learning system.

The hybrid learning approach combines online and classroom instruction. While online instruction is more flexible since students may access self-learning materials through multiple platforms online at any time they choose, classroom learning requires students to attend class during the scheduled class time period (Sanpanich, 2021). Due to the fact that hybrid learning transcends several sectors and disciplines and that there are gaps in previous research regarding its implementation, there are several studies on the subject matter (Futch et al., 2016). According to (Correia, 2016), there is little research on the pedagogical approach to hybrid learning. This study attempted to fill this gap by examining the teaching strategies employed by the English instructors in higher-level vocational education.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

## Hybrid Learning

Around 2000 marked the emergence of hybrid learning in the classroom, and it is currently very prevalent, particularly in both commercial and academic settings. The current studies interchangeably utilizes the phrases "blended," "hybrid," "technology-mediated learning," "web-enhanced learning," and "mixed-mode instructional (Sharma, 2014). There are many different ways to define hybrid learning, but it is generally thought of as simply integrating conventional teaching methods with virtual educational activities. Hybrid learning has been described by (Graham, 2006) as systems that incorporate in-person education with digital classroom instruction.

Hybrid learning is the purposeful combination of in-person learning opportunities in the classroom with online learning activities. integrating the features of both asynchronous and synchronous instructional approaches is of considerable interest (Garrison & Kanuka, 2004) . Hybrid learning is described as an approach to integrating information and communication technologies with instructional planning that improve the educational experience for both students and educators. Blending allows for improved learning outcomes and experiences for the students. More effective teaching will result from the integration of delivery methods and instructional strategies (Bath & Bourke, 2010).

In order to effectively meet learning objectives, hybrid learning is a systematic design approach that openly accesses and aligns the features of face-to-face and online learning. According to (Garrison & D.Norman, 2008) hybrid learning is the knowledgeable merging of in-person and online learning experiences, bringing up several opportunities to redesign traditional activities in the classroom.

In a comparable manner, Innes & Wilton (2018) define hybrid learning as the provision of teaching and learning experiences through the blending of both online and face-to-face Through virtual communities, students may digitally interact during this technologically driven learning experience. The majority of people acknowledge that hybrid learning incorporates features of both asynchronous and synchronous online instructional alternatives and blends methods of instruction and learning from in person, mobile, and internet-based learning (Angadi, 2016). The blend of conventional classroom or online classroom experiences is, thus, the most widely accepted definition of hybrid learning.

## Technology in Implementation of Hybrid Learning Based Instruction

Technological innovation, material, and pedagogical must all be combined in order to effectively use hybrid learning, and these components must be represented in both the teaching and learning processes (Embi et al., 2014). With the introduction of contemporary technology or cutting-edge media for education, the conventional teaching style that concentrated on topic knowledge has changed. According to Ghavifekr & Rosdy (2015), ICT integration will assist instructors in meeting the worldwide need to substitute conventional teaching technology.

The technology used in hybrid learning offers a number of engaging methods to enhance learning, such as instructional videos, stimulation, storage of data, database use, mind-mapping, guided inquiry, discussion, audio recordings, and the internet (Finger & Trinidad, 2002). Without adequate implementation and management in terms of distribution, instructor role, infrastructure circumstance, etc., the adoption of technological devices in the hybrid classroom can be extremely overwhelming (Alakarash & Razak, 2020).

#### **METHOD**

#### Material and Method

Due to the Covid19 which requires people to do the social distance, the data of the research were collected through online narrative inquiry using online video conferencing Zoom. The virtual interview questions were developed with the research study's objective in consideration. The interview protocols are divided into three parts as follows:

- 1. Part One questioned for historical data about lecturers, such as gender, ages, the number of years of teaching expertise, and backgrounds in education.
- 2. Part Two is to gather data about the used of online technology platform and online material in supporting hybrid learning environment.
- 3. Part Three is designed to gather data on instructors' strategies for integrating hybrid learning into their classroom practices. The interview protocol, which comprises the

*Hybrid Learning Implementation in English for Business Communication in Indonesian Vocational Higher Education* 

interview guidelines, was the other tool employed in this study. The open-ended inquiries used in the study's interview section are connected to those used in the online questionnaire session. For this study, both quantitative and qualitative methods were utilized to collect data.

#### Participants

Three foreign language teachers who are currently teaching English for Business Communication in the Business Administration Department at the State Polytechnic of Ujung Pandang Indonesia participated in the study on a modest scale.

#### Data analysis

The qualitative element of the data was assessed thematically, while the quantitative data were descriptively constructed. This indicates that the qualitative form's data was arranged in accordance with the general trends found in the quantitative data.

#### **FINDINGS**

## Participants' demographic information

Three English teachers, two of whom are men and one of whom is a woman, are the research's participants. The age range of the participants is from 36 to 50 years old. 10 to 25 years are the average duration of teaching experience. Two of the participants are MA graduates, and one is a Ph.D. graduate. These show that the majority of research participants are knowledgeable lecturers who are engaged in their teaching activities.

## Hybrid learning-based instruction incorporating ICT integration

Below, we'll go into further detail about how technology is used to implement hybrid learning in the teaching of English for business communication courses. Based on the data interview, it was discovered that the implementation of Blended Learning appears at the course and activity levels in Polytechnic Negeri Ujung Pandang. During the epidemic Covid19, however, lecturers used a Fully Online Blended Learning Model that included several online platforms such as learning management systems, Zoom, Google Meet, Google Classroom, and other social media platforms such as YouTube, Facebook, and WhatsApp.

# Moodle (Modular Object-Oriented Dynamic Learning Environment)

The result from data interview showed that in the early implementation of Hybrid Learning in 2012, one of the the teacher-participant used Moodle version 2.0, one platform for Learning Management System. This can be seen from the extract of the interview with the teacher.

"I utilized Moodle in the initial stages of my experiment with the online platform. I utilized a prior model of Moodle from 2012 to 2014. It is an open-source platform developed primarily for e-learning." (R1).

Other surprising result from the interview, that the teachers never attended any professional development trainings in using technology for pedagogical uses. He learned about the utilizing of the technology autodidact, he learned it from the internet as can be seen below:

'I learned about technology several years ago, however, now I feel I don't have a lot of time to learn a new technology (R3)

'I do not additionally attend such Moodle training. I just learnt from the internet through the YouTube channel and various internet resources'.(R1)

'I did not participate to any formal training; I discovered things on myself, yep, learning by doing.' (R2)

Others comment on teacher technology competency.

'I learnt about technology a decade ago, but today I don't think I have enough time to fully comprehend an emerging technology (R3).

Moodle is used to build personal websites with online instruction for lecturers and learners to accomplish learning objectives because of customized administration capabilities. Using plugins created by the community, Moodle enables further development and personalization of the educational settings. The result showed that the teacher did research in developing and implementing Hybrid Learning, hosted Moodle online platform on his website, he also spend his own money to support this application.

"I managed the Moodle platform on my personal website, so I purchased a hosting site and then hosted the Moodle platform on my website." Then I began researching how to *Hybrid Learning Implementation in English for Business Communication in Indonesian Vocational Higher Education* 

create an e-learning system, which I then implemented in my classroom. There was no institutional e-learning at the time. So it was entirely my decision to use the platform on my own."

After two years of early Hybrid Learning adoption, the educator chose to discontinue

using the Moodle application due to concerns about the platform's efficacy and user-

friendliness

"In 2015, I decided to discontinue using this platform due to its ineffectiveness." In terms of what I call "user friendliness." It was not accessible for beginners, particularly students with poor digital competence. So it was tough for me to maintain employing this platform since, as you know, we require further preparation to work with it. It was quite demanding, so I decided to quit it completely in 2015."

Apart from the platform's effectiveness, additional reasons for teachers to give up Moodle include its user-friendly design and the platform's lack of interactivity.

"I discontinued it in 2015 for several reasons, including: 1) the platform was not practical, 2) the user interface was unattractive to me, so I was required to perform plenty of settings for its improved application, 3) it was neither engaging nor live interaction with the students and 4) we needed a website developing competence for hosting the platform within a web cloud or on a campus server."

The teacher discovered that integrating technology was difficult not only for teachers

owing to a lack of technological competence, but also for students due to their comprehension

of the platform employed.

"My experience actually included the students, and my problem at the time was that it was quite challenging to me to navigate that platform because it was not exclusively about my expertise with the platform, but it also related to the student's acceptability of Moodle." It appeared to be unfamiliar to them, therefore the students were unable to determine how to utilize the platform. It was challenging for students, and they were incapable to navigate the platform. (R1)

In respond to this challenge, the lecturer (R1) periodically briefed the students about

how to use the LMS.

"So it took me quite a while to train students in order to engage securely via a learning management system."

Respondent 2 (R2) saw the situation from another perspective.

"I believe the platform is simple for students to use because they are millennial who are acquainted with technology." The students' issues are limited to the internet connection" (R2).

## Institutional Online Platform Using Moodle Version 3.7

The pandemic Covid19 compelled all institutions worldwide, including Politeknik Negeri Ujung Pandang (PNUP), to switch from conventional instruction to only distance learning. As a result, PNUP mandates instructors to utilize the institutional digital platform, which can be accessible at <a href="https://elearning.an.poliupg.ac.id">https://elearning.an.poliupg.ac.id</a>. Nevertheless, just a small number of the lecturers were acquainted with this kind of platform. To prepare for this circumstance, PNUP e-learning administrators conducted a brief online course in each department, which had been attended by all professors. In addition, PNUP has developed a tutorial to demonstrate how to utilize this platform. The excerpt below demonstrates the various reactions of lecturers to this regulation.

"We had training in ways to utilize Moodle just recently or a few weeks ago." I only want to point out that it is not a straightforward procedure since, as you know, Moodle is not easy to navigate, and it takes time to grasp all of its features. You will need time to comprehend the functionality of this Moodle, in addition to how to interface it with different platforms and become acquainted with the Moodle's instructions. But I don't think it's an issue for me because I'm already acquainted with that platform (R1).

I've taken the brief training to use the institutional LMS offered by campus and I think it's vigorously but complicated, therefore I've opted not to employ it very often (R3).

Other teachers stipulated, that "Some people claim it's convenient for us to navigate this platform because it's accessible for free because the institution has provided tutorials to assist educators who intend on employing this platform." It's not that straightforward; e-learning might be challenging for individuals who are inexperienced with the platform. This is accessible to certain people. Not all lecturers can." That is why I avoid using the institutional learning management system." (R2)*Google Classroom* 

The data collected from virtual interviews with the research respondents revealed that when an issue emerged concerning the high usage of web-cloud videoconferencing services such as Zoom, Google Meet, or Jitsi during The global epidemic Covid19, the teacher was compelled to examine a different distance learning platform, Google Classroom. He transitioned from a synchronous platform, Zoom, to an asynchronous mode platform, Google Classroom, after investigating and discovering it. The interview excerpt is provided below.

"Google Classroom has grown in prominence in recent years. Let us say, after the global pandemic I've currently used this platform likewise. I haven't gained much experience with this platform yet because it's unfamiliar to me, and I'm simply searching for potential ways to use it. I also do research to further comprehend the platform." (R1)

# A Web-Cloud Video Conferencing Platform

According to the findings of the virtual interviews, all instructors employed web-cloud video conferencing platforms such as Zoom and Google Classroom to deliver the curriculum. A year after deciding to discontinue using Moodle version 2, the instructor (R1) kept on searching for any other platform that may be utilized in teaching English for Business Communication. He began utilizing Zoom, a web-cloud video conferencing software, in 2016.

"I continue to investigate any potential platform for my teaching, and I have finally discovered a newly developed platform, the video conferencing platform." This refers to the platform we are currently using. Zoom was the reason." (R1)The data gained from virtual interview that in delivering the material all teachers used web-cloud video conferencing platform; Zoom and Google Classroom

## Zoom

Based on the data obtained from the virtual interview, a year after deciding to discontinue using Moodle version 2, the instructor (R1) continued to look for alternative platforms that may be utilized in teaching English for Business Communication. He began utilizing Zoom, a web-cloud video conferencing software, in 2016.

"I continue to investigate any prospective platform for my teaching, and I have finally discovered an emerging platform, the video conferencing platform." This is the platform we are currently using. Zoom was the reason." (R1)

The instructor worked tirelessly to learn about the potential of utilizing Zoom in his teaching, and he recognized that the platform was appropriate for teaching considering Zoom was originally designed for commercial reasons.

"Then. I investigated and implemented the platform, then looked into the various options for delivering the material via the internet. The platform was actually fairly user-friendly at that moment. So, I'm convinced that are several issues we must address,

#### Andi Musdariah

and we demand a lot of investigation within this field to figure out the most effective methods of improving the usage of this platform. I believe that there is nevertheless a long way to go towards rendering online learning efficient and adaptable. We must seek out everything, considering this educational, and utilize Zoom or any additional sort of platform as a teaching instrument. So we need to investigate if this can be utilized for teaching because it was originally developed for business purposes. Yes, the customers of Zoom are primarily employees or individuals who work in a company, but it wasn't intended primarily for instruction." (R1)

After long exploration the teachers found that Zoom was good application for teaching social sciences like language teaching. All respondents have good responses about the use of Zoom in teaching English for Business Communication. As a result, the teachers discovered that Zoom was an excellent tool for teaching social sciences such as language. "All participant responded positively to the use of Zoom in teaching English for Business Communication for Business Communication.

"So I would like to look at the potential of implementing this platform for instruction. As progressed, I discovered that this platform actually proves beneficial for teaching topics, particularly for social science and language classes that are conceptual rather than experiential. (R1)

"One of the benefits of using Zoom for instruction is the fact the platform offers multiple features that can be readily used, such as online presentations, file and document sharing, and online chat (R2)."

"With Zoom, we may conduct presentations online, share documents and files, participate in a chat (ask questions), organize the participants, practice speaking, listening, as well as video sharing, and so on" (R3).

In terms of adaptability, one participant stated "Zoom is an adaptable and excellent platform.

"The website is an outstanding real-time platform where we may communicate digitally with the kids via live-streaming video. As a result, I believe this is a representative platform." (R2)

According to the aforementioned comment, the instructor regarded Zoom was an excellent tool since it allows English teachers to interact with their students together in a frictionless atmosphere to get more accomplished. Zoom's capabilities enable English teachers to investigate and evaluate the four competencies through dynamic student interactions. Zoom may make classes more engaging along with to screen sharing.

"There are a lot of things we need to discover and enhance behind this, but we also need a lot of encouragement and other things." Maybe I'm going to have to modify or enhance the effectiveness of this platform later." (R1)

## Social Media

In accordance with the findings from the interviews, two of the respondents employed social media sites such as WhatsApp, Facebook, and YouTube, while another research participant rejected the opportunity to utilize the platform.

"I simply utilize it for interactions, instead of using it for instruction with students, realtime interaction I'm considering I had been searching for a platform whereby I could employ for real-time communication with a student." I started to accomplish this via platforms for social media such as Facebook and WhatsApp as a mechanism for mediated interaction. "I name it Facebook-mediated interactions or a social media platform for communicating with students" (R1).

Since 2014, I used FB as a teaching tool. I organized a private group and then distributed the content to it. I further utilized the group to facilitate interaction between instructors and learners and to promote communication among students. Furthermore, students may exchange and upload their coursework using the app's interface. (R2)

I never employ social media for instruction, but I regularly employ WhatsApp for communicating with students, such as sharing the link to the participant list and introducing class activities (R3).

It is evident that the participants exclusively employed WhatsApp to communicate with

the students. The findings obtained from the virtual interview with the instructor reveal that

the restricted real-time interactional characteristics of both Facebook and WhatsApp are the

primary cause for the instructor's refusal to utilize these prominent social media platforms as

a method of instruction.

"Because platform like WhatsApp and Facebook has limited features for building real time interactions with a students. FB and WA are designed for communications. They are not designed for teaching. (R1)

"As platforms like WhatsApp and Facebook have restricted functionalities for creating real-time interactions with students." FB and WA are intended for interaction. Those are not meant at instructional." (R1)

Nevertheless are several alternatives for merging social media with other online teaching platforms in his Hybrid Learning development program.

"That is correct, but we continue to explore several of the opportunities for integrating this platform with other platforms in order to develop a comprehensive Hybrid Learning." Everything is conceivable. In my professional life, I just use it to develop communication for specific subjects, to ensure that students can view and command. It wasn't designed for real-time interaction" (R2).

### The Level of Hybrid Learning Adoption

Hybrid Learning was implemented among lecturers in this study in a variety of methods, namely Rich Implemented Hybrid Learning (RIHL), Moderate Implemented Hybrid Learning (MIHL), and Poor Implemented Hybrid Learning (PIHL). Rich Implemented Hybrid Learning (RIHL) is characterized by the most frequent use of Hybrid Learning in teaching Business English at all different stages of instruction: preparation, implementation, and assessment. It is particularly notable for the diversity of technologies used in the classroom instructional approach (R1).

The participant designated as Moderately Implemented Hybrid Learning (MIHL) is the instructor who implemented Hybrid Learning for fifty percent of the course and used fewer technological devices (R2). Poorly Implemented Hybrid Learning (PIHL) refers to teachers who use Hybrid Learning at least frequently in their classrooms (R3).

Based on the research, participants with the most advanced and intermediate degrees use Hybrid Learning at all levels of teaching, including planning, instructional practice, assignment, task, and assessment or evaluation. Discovering relevant references and supplementary resources, searching for trustworthy internet information, generating syllabi and assignment varieties, and designing models and approaches for teaching Business English are all instances of teaching readiness.

The tasks part may include uploading homework mostly through Google Drive or YouTube, inquiring about the sorts of tasks, and reading and comprehending the instructions for each assignment. Finally, tasks for evaluation include assessing students' assignments, providing feedback, and reflecting on their advancement. The examination or evaluation of learners' business presentations utilizing a rubric in the form of formative tests such as quizzes, midterms, and finals. Two participants use a variety of apps to perform Hybrid Learning, involving Edmodo, Google Classroom, Web-based learning, Macromedia Flash, , Zoom video-conferencing, the institutional learning management system, and Google Meet.

The participants also use social media platforms such as Facebook and the WhatsApp application. Furthermore, the instructor employed the web-based tool for sharing "YouTube" in the Hybrid Learning class since those applications are more appealing and versatile. One participant utilized email to distribute materials and tasks to learners, then Zoom to provide feedback on the assignments.

## DISCUSSION

To have excellent teaching in the teaching and learning process, the adoption of Blended Learning involves the combination of three components: technology, content, and pedagogy. Initially, one of the participants (R1) used Moodle, an open source e-learning software platform which was created by Martin Dougiamas. Teachers can leverage Moodle to develop captivating online courses that encourage interaction among their students. Moodle allows instructors to create material and blend activities into stages that guide learners via pre-structured learning paths (Dvorak, 2011). Moodle is a free educational platform that enables instructors to develop their own personalized website with innovative courses allowing them to expand their learning whenever and wherever they selected. The learning management system Moodle's open source platform features may be customized to match the needs of the user (Sulisworo et al., 2016).

Moodle is used for hybrid learning, distance education, flipped classrooms, and other e-learning attempts in schools, universities, enterprises, and other sectors (Josemary & Dechsubha, 2018). Moodle is built on constructivist principles and pedagogical practices, according to (Şahin Kızıl, 2014). As stated in Dvorak (2011) there are no upfront costs arising from obtaining the program, and there are neither license nor registration charges. Moodle is open-source software, which implies that all updates, consents, facilities and tutorials are freely.

#### Andi Musdariah

#### *Hybrid Learning Implementation in English for Business Communication in Indonesian Vocational Higher Education*

After coping with Moodle's shortcomings, the teacher turned to Google Classroom, which was added to Google Apps for Education in 2014. Through the free web-based service Google Classroom, Google Account Apps for Education are connected with all Google Apps, including Google Docs, Google Mail, and Google Calendar. These characteristics can be integrated for support with a school activity. The features include several collaboration components such as peers adapting validating, and assessing. Furthermore, Google Classroom enables users to connect with one another and collaborate on projects (Subandoro & Sulindra, 2019).

The use of a platform including Google Classroom, which enables teachers to quickly develop and organize tasks, provide feedback effectively, and interact with their classes online or through blending learning, has many benefits over the conventional classroom teaching method (Sukmawati & Nensia, 2019). The tool can make it simple for lecturers to administer the classroom, including assigning work, interacting, and monitoring materials. With all these tools for collaborative classroom activities, Google Classroom might be considered to facilitate collaborative learning in some extent. All that is required to use Google Classroom is digital competence, particularly for the elderly cohort of lecturers and for the students who haven't had a lot of exposure to digital technologies.

The data gathered throughout the virtual interview revealed that the teacher continued to search for a platform appropriate for teaching English for Business Communication one year after opting to discontinue the use of Moodle version 2 and eventually discovered Zoom. It is the market pioneer in modern corporate live communications, according to (Guzacheva N, 2020) with an easy, trustworthy cloud-based solution for audio and video meetings, interaction, chat, and conferences across mobile devices, cellphones, and room configurations. Zoom is an online service that provides Conferencing and Webinars, as well as document sharing and video conferencing.

The participants additionally utilized social media platforms as the beneficial findings of previous research conducted in several countries such as India, India, Turkey, Saudi Arabia, and Nigeria on the efficacy of mobile learning and the application of social media platforms to explore the effectiveness of mobile technology in promoting Hybrid Learning courses (Barhoumi, 2015) and fulfill mobile learning objectives (Boyinbode et al., 2017) to increase students' communication competencies, self-assurance, and English engagement (Maulina et al., 2022).

The delivery of materials, discussions and question and answer, assignments, and feedback on student performance are all part of the instructional work. The instructor used online video conferencing platforms such as Google Meet, Zoom, and Jitzi to provide the lessons in the hybrid learning system. The teachers used both authentic and non-authentic resources to teach English for Business Communication. Written material, motion pictures, ads, and pictures are examples of authentic materials, whereas non-authentic materials are those that have been developed specifically for teaching, which include ESP printed sheets, business podcasts, electronic books, audio, and corporate vocabulary examination (Anas et al., 2020). For adopting hybrid learning, all participants selected the Flipped Approach. The flipped hybrid learning technique was effective in establishing an optimal balance between information delivery and student autonomy. It highlighted the cultivation of critical thinking abilities and individual learning for students (Uluçınar et al., 2017)

## CONCLUSION

Lecturers in this study employed Hybrid Learning in various ways, including Rich Implemented Hybrid Learning (RIHL), Moderate Implemented Hybrid Learning (MIHL), and Poor Implemented Hybrid Learning (PIHL). It may be inferred that the more diverse the application of Hybrid Learning in teaching English for Business Communication, more favorable the outcome of students' business English performances. This study aimed to broaden scholarly understanding of Hybrid Learning instruction in teaching English for Business in Indonesian Vocational Higher Education. This study has pedagogic consequences regarding how vital it is to use different types of hybrid learning in English instruction. For the successful application of hybrid learning, teachers must demonstrate their technology understanding, subject knowledge, and pedagogical expertise.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT

## No funding bodies is associated with this study

## **CONFLICT OF INTEREST**

## No conflict of interest reported by the author

## **REFERENCES**

Alakarash, H., & Razak, N. (2020). The Asian ESP Journal. The Asian ESP Journal, 16(4), 6-21.

- Albers, B., & Pattuwage, L. (2017). Implementation in Education Findings from a Scoping Review Prepared for Evidence for Learning (E4L) Implementation in Education Findings from a Scoping Review. www.cei.org.au
- Anas, I., Amansyah, F., Musdariah, A., & Irmawati. (2020). Technological and pedagogical considerations in supporting electronic self-access language learning (e-sall): In-person learning practice in the time of crisis. *SiSal Journal*, 11(3), 128–134. https://doi.org/10.37237/110303
- Angadi, G. R. (2016). Student-teachers perceptions towards Blended Learning Approach in Critical Understanding of ICT in Education. International Journal of Research in Economics and Social Sciences (IMPACT FACTOR – International Journal of Research in Economics & Social Sciences, 6225(6), 77 = 82. http://www.euroasiapub.org
- Barhoumi, C. (2015). The Effectiveness of WhatsApp Mobile Learning Activities Guided by Activity Theory on Students' Knowldege Management. *Contemporary Educational Technology*, 6(3), 221–238.
- Bath, D., & Bourke, J. (2010). Getting Started with Blended Learning. In *Griffith Institute for Higher Education Phone:* Griffith Institute for Higher Education. https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-61350-147-4.ch023
- Boyinbode, O. K., Agbonifo, O. C., & Ogundare, A. (2017). Supporting Mobile Learning with WhatsApp based on Media Richness. *Circulation in Computer Science*, 2(3), 37–46. https://doi.org/10.22632/ccs-2017-251-89
- Correia, M. (2016). *An Investigation of Teacher and Administrator Perceptions of Blended Learning: Implementation, Student Learning, and Professional Development.* Western Connecticut State University.
- Dvorak, R. (2011). Moodle for Dummies (K. Kirschner (ed.); 1st ed.).
- Embi, M. A., Hussin, S., & Panah, E. (2014). Flipped Learning Readiness among Graduate and Postgraduate Students in UKM. In *Blended & Flipped Learning: Case Studies in Malaysian HEI*.

- Finger, G., & Trinidad, S. (2002). ICTs for learning: An overview of systemic initiatives in the Australian States and Territories. *Australian Educational Computing*, 17(2), 3–14.
- Futch, L., Thompson, K., Howard, W., & DeNoyelles, A. (2016). "Comfort" as a Critical Success Factor in Blended Learning Courses. *Online Learning*, 20(3), 140–158.
- Garrison, D. R., & D.Norman, V. (2008). Blended Learning in Higher Education Framework, Principles, and Guidelines (Fiirst). JOSSEY-BASS.
- Garrison, D. R., & Kanuka, H. (2004). Blended learning: Uncovering its transformative potential in higher education. *Internet and Higher Education*, 7(2), 95–105. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.iheduc.2004.02.001
- Ghavifekr, S., & Rosdy, W. A. W. (2015). Teaching and Learning with Technology: Effectiveness of ICT Integration in Schools. *International Journal of Research in Education and Science*, 1(2), 175–191. https://doi.org/10.21890/ijres.23596
- Graham, C. R. (2006). Blended learning systems: Definition, current trends, and future directions. *Handbook of Blended Learning: Global Perspectives, Local Designs, January* 2006, 3–21.
- Guzacheva N. (2020). Zoom Technology as an Effective Tool for Distance Learning. *Pedagogical Science*, *6*(5), 457–460.
- Innes, M., & Wilton, D. (2018). Guide to Blended Learning. In *The Commonwealth of Learning* (*COL*) (Issue 1). The Commonwealth of Learning (COL).
- Lestari, A. S. (2016). Analysis of the Implementation of e-Learning in Stain Sultan Qaimuddin Kendari Southeast Sulawesi. *Inteernational Journal of Information and Education Teachnology*, 6(6), 453–456. https://doi.org/10.7763/IJIET.2016.V6.731
- Maulina, M., Ladjagang, R., Nasrullah, R., M. Esteban Jr, A., Hastianah, H., & Herianah, H. (2022). Conceptualizing Research Methods Used in Teaching Listening Skill Studies Using Social Media and Technological Tools. *Journal of Education and Teaching (JET)*, 3(1), 69–83. https://doi.org/10.51454/jet.v3i1.140
- Purnomo, W., Syafitri, D., & Raflesia, C. (2022). The Role of Blended Learning Model in Learning for Students. *LITERATUR: Jurnal Bahasa, Sastra Dan Pengajaran*, 3(1), 54–70. https://doi.org/10.31539/literatur.v3i1.4999
- Şahin Kızıl, A. (2014). Blended instruction for EFL learners:Engagement, learning and course satisfaction. *The JALT CALL Journal*, *10*(3), 175–188.
- Sanpanich, N. (2021). Investigating Factors Affecting Students' Attitudes toward Hybrid Learning. *REFLections*, 28(2), 208–227.
- Sharma, V. (2014). Blended Learning a Boon or Bane for Teacher-Learner. *Indian Streams Research Journal*, 4(4), 1–7.
- Subandoro, P. S., & Sulindra, E. (2019). Optimizing Collaborative Learning: Using Google Classroom in Business English Correspondence Class. *VOCATIO: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Administrasi Dan Sekretaris*, 2(1), 1–18. https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781107415324.004
- Sukmawati, S., & Nensia, N. (2019). The Role of Google Classroom in ELT. International Journal for Educational and Vocational Studies, 1(2), 142–145. https://doi.org/10.29103/ijevs.v1i2.1526

- Sulisworo, D., Agustin, S. P., & Endang, S. (2016). Cooperative-blended learning using Moodle as an open source learning platform. *Int. J. Technology Enhanced Learning*, 8(2), 187–198.
- Uluçınar, S., Şafak, S., & Dilek. (2017). Flipped classroom model in education. International Journal of Social Sciences and Education Research, 3(5 S), 1904–1916. https://doi.org/10.24289/ijsser.348068

# **ABOUT THE AUTHOR**

Andi Musdariah Email: andimusdariah.am@gmail.com ORCID ID 000000290292777 Scopus ID 57219143813 Sinta ID 6041319

Andi Musdariah is a lecturer at Business Administration Department, State Polytechnic of Ujung Pandang, Indonesia. She obtained her master's degree in English Language Study from Hasanuddin University. She received her doctoral's degree from Makassar State University. Her interests are Hybrid Learning, ICT in Education, Classroom Management and Project Based Learning.